

Haldane fractional statistics in the fractional quantum Hall effect

M.D. Johnson* and G.S. Canright†

**Department of Physics, University of Central Florida, Orlando, FL 32816-2385*

†*Department of Physics. University of Tennessee, Knoxville, TN 37996-1200*

Abstract

We have tested Haldane's "fractional-Pauli-principle" description of excitations around the $\nu = 1/3$ state in the FQHE, using exact results for small systems of electrons. We find that Haldane's prediction $\beta = \pm 1/m$ for quasiholes and quasiparticles, respectively, describes our results well with the modification $\beta_{qp} = 2 - 1/3$ rather than $-1/3$. We also find that this approach enables us to better understand the *energetics* of the "daughter" states; in particular, we find good evidence, in terms of the effective interaction between quasiparticles, that the states $\nu = 4/11$ and $4/13$ should not be stable.

05.30.-d, 73.20.Dx, 73.20.Mf

The traditional way to define fractional statistics is in terms of the exchange phase $e^{i\alpha\pi}$ which is developed by the wavefunction when two identical particles are exchanged [1]. For bosons $\alpha = 0$ and for fermions $\alpha = 1$. Particles with fractional statistics (*i.e.*, fractional values of α) can, in principle, exist in two dimensions. A common model of fractional statistics represents this exchange phase by adding an infinitesimal tube of magnetic flux (and a coupling charge) to ordinary fermions or bosons.

Recently Haldane [2] proposed an alternative approach to fractional statistics which applies to the case of systems with a finite Hilbert space (or subspace). Letting d_n be the size of the single-particle Hilbert space available to the n^{th} identical particle, Haldane defined a fractional exclusion coefficient β by $\beta = -(d_{n+\Delta n} - d_n)/\Delta n$. Haldane argued for a correspondence between the exchange phase α and the generalized Pauli coefficient β for the bulk excitations in the fractional quantum Hall effect (FQHE) [3], based on the variational form of their wavefunctions. For quasiholes (qh) and quasiparticles (qp) near filling factor $\nu = 1/m$, with m an odd integer, Haldane obtained $\beta_{qh} = 1/m$ and $\beta_{qp} = -1/m$.

In this paper we test the utility of Haldane's approach for describing the low-energy excitations in the FQHE, using exact diagonalization of small systems of electrons. Our method relies on the single assumption that the number of quasiholes and quasiparticles in a many-electron state may be counted in the usual way. We first obtain the many-particle generalization of Haldane's definition, which is needed for analyzing the numerical results. We then find that Haldane's description works well—giving an unambiguous determination of the fractional exclusion coefficient β for a given energy scale—with one significant modification, namely, that β_{qp} is positive. Our analysis yields as a further result information about the effective interactions between the excitations, in terms of which the absence of the fractions $\nu = 4/13$ and $\nu = 4/11$ can be simply understood.

The belief that bulk excitations in the FQHE should exhibit fractional (α) statistics [4] is based upon the variational forms for their wavefunctions. These variational forms accurately describe the numerically-obtained eigenstates for a single qh or qp [5] or for several [6]. The variational wavefunctions develop phases under the motion of a qh or qp exactly as if it saw the electrons as quanta of flux [4]. This is the basis of the 'hierarchy' explanation of the allowed fractions in the FQHE [7,8]. An alternative construction of the bulk excitations is given by a mapping to the integer quantum Hall effect [9]. This has recently been used by Jain and co-workers to construct other variational wavefunctions as an alternative explanation of the FQHE [10].

In this paper we are interested in analyzing the structure of the exact low-energy spectrum (obtained numerically). In the case of quasiholes it was first shown by Johnson and MacDonald [11] that the nominal qh states are separated by an energy gap from other states, and that these agree in total number and in multiplet structure with either the 'hierarchy' or 'integer-mapping' approach. More recently He, Xie and Zhang pointed out that there is a similar gap, although less pronounced, for nominal qp states [12]; in this case the low-energy set of qp states can be thought of as those with an extra two zeros in their relative pseudo-wavefunction. Here too the multiplet structure and energies can be obtained either by the hierarchy [6] or integer-mapping [10] approaches. In this paper we show that the exact low-energy spectra of interacting electrons can be described simply and usefully by appealing to Haldane's formulation of fractional statistics.

We begin by proposing a many-particle generalization of Haldane's definition [11]. Let

N_n be the dimension of the many-particle Hilbert space for n identical particles. (N_n is taken finite, by assuming a finite volume and an energy cutoff [2].) Then

$$N_n = \binom{d_n + n - 1}{n} = \binom{d_1 + (1 - \beta)(n - 1)}{n}. \quad (1)$$

One can argue that Eq. (1) is no more than a restatement of Haldane's definition of the coefficient β , via the single-particle dimension d_n . An alternative derivation, which is both illustrative and appropriate to the problem at hand, may be made by considering the Hilbert space of a collection of α -anyons, in the lowest Landau level [13], confined to a disc of radius R . Wavefunctions for this problem have the form

$$\Psi' = f(z_1, z_2, \dots, z_n) \prod_{i < j=1}^n (z_i - z_j)^\alpha e^{-\sum_k^n |z_k|^2/4}, \quad (2)$$

where f is any symmetric polynomial. One then finds, by considering the degree of f in terms of the analogous problem for bosons, that the number of states in the disc (and in the lowest Landau level) is $\binom{R+1+(1-\alpha)(n-1)}{n}$. This is of the form Eq. (1), with β equal to α . The key ingredient of this result is that increased angular momentum, in a magnetic field and in the lowest Landau level, requires more area—and hence fills the Hilbert space faster for fixed area. Thus, for particles in the lowest Landau level, there is an intimate connection between the Haldane coefficient β and the exchange phase α (as noted by Haldane [2]), namely, $\alpha = \beta \pmod{2}$.

Consider in this example the smaller subset obtained by keeping only those states with two extra relative zeros, *i.e.*, for which the symmetric polynomial can be written with an extra Jastrow factor, $f = \prod_{i < j} (z_i - z_j)^2 f'$. By the above argument, this extra angular momentum requires increased area and hence fills the chosen subspace more rapidly. In general, the subset with $2l$ extra zeros in the relative wavefunction can be described by a Haldane coefficient $\beta + 2l$, and has a dimension

$$N_n^{2l} = \binom{d_1 + (1 - \beta - 2l)(n - 1)}{n}. \quad (3)$$

This correspondence between extra zeros and the value of the Haldane β coefficient will prove to be very useful in analyzing FQHE results.

Now we use these ideas to investigate the utility of Haldane's approach to fractional statistics. To test for β statistics we work in a spherical geometry [14], where N_e electrons move in a radially outward uniform magnetic field with $N_L - 1$ flux quanta, giving N_L states in the lowest Landau level. When $N_L = m(N_e - 1) + 1$, the filling factor in the ground state is exactly $\nu = 1/m$. When n extra flux quanta are added, we assume that n qh are created; or when n are removed, n qp are present. One can instead create qh/qp by keeping the Hamiltonian fixed (holding N_L fixed)—which is necessary in the determination of β —and instead changing N_e . This creates qh or qp in multiples of m . We use the standard decomposition [15] for the interaction between electrons in the lowest Landau level, resolving it into pseudopotential parameters $V_1, V_3, V_5, \dots$, where V_l gives the energy of a pair of electrons in relative angular momentum (RAM) l . These fall off monotonically (if slowly) as l grows.

In this work we will mostly consider states near $\nu = 1/3$, with V_1 and V_3 nonzero, and $V_3 \ll V_1$. The fractional quantum Hall effect at $\nu = 1/3$ is related to the existence of states for $\nu \leq 1/3$ which completely avoid unit RAM, and hence pay no V_1 cost. These states do, however, typically have electron pairs in RAM 3, and hence have energies on a scale set by V_3 . Thus the spectrum (for $\nu < 1/3$) has a subset of low-energy (qh) states, lying below a gap of order V_1 and separated among themselves by energies of order V_3 . The qp side ($\nu \geq 1/3$) is similar but energetically harder to separate. We will begin by discussing the qh case.

We find numerically that when there are nominally n qh present (*i.e.*, when $N_L = 3N_e - 2 + n$), there is a well-defined subset of states of dimension

$$N_n^{qh} = \binom{N_e + n}{n} \quad (4)$$

lying below a gap in energy of order V_1 . This is the case for N_e from 2 to 7 and n from 1 to 6. It is illustrated for 6 electrons in Fig. 1(a). This dimension, and the multiplet structure, can be explained [11] equally well either by mapping to bosons as in the bosonic hierarchy approach [8], or by mapping to fermions as in the integer-mapping approach [10].

The beauty of Haldane's treatment is that it provides an *unambiguous* determination of what β statistics should be assigned to the excitations. Noting that $N_L = 3N_e - 2 + n$ states in the lowest Landau level give n qh for ν near but below $1/3$, we can write Eq. (4) as

$$N_n = \binom{(N_L + 4)/3 + (1 - 1/3)(n - 1)}{n}. \quad (5)$$

From Eq. (5) we can read off, by comparison with Eq. (1), a Haldane coefficient $\beta = 1/3$ for qh near $\nu = 1/3$. (We have also verified that $\beta_{qh} = +1/5$ for qh near $\nu = 1/5$.) Hence we confirm, using exact electronic eigenstates and standard counting of the qh, the identification $\beta_{qh} = +1/m$ originally given by Haldane. This is, to our knowledge, the first non-variational calculation of fractional statistics in the FQHE [16].

Haldane's scheme can be used to obtain further information from the structure of the low-energy spectrum. We use as a guide pseudo-wavefunctions of the form Eq. (2). Such wavefunctions vanish at zero separation according to the power law r^α where $r = |z_i - z_j|$. It is possible to identify smaller subsets which vanish according to a higher power law, *e.g.*, as $r^{2l+\alpha}$. The number of such states with $2l$ extra zeros is, by Eq. (3), $\binom{N_e + n - 2l(n-1)}{n}$. We find that it is in fact possible to identify subsets of 2-qh states with $2l$ extra zeros. This enables us to estimate effective two-body interaction energies for the excitations, which in turn allows a clear evaluation of the stability of certain hierarchy fractions.

We use a procedure for analyzing the multiplets which has been described previously [11]. A slight generalization of this procedure enables us to identify the multiplet structures of the subsets with $2l$ or more extra zeros. Consider, for example, $n = 2$ qh and $N_e = 6$ electrons. There are, by Eq. (1), 28 states lying below the V_1 gap; these break into multiplets with $L = 0, 2, 4, 6$. Now, by Eq. (3), there are 15 states with 2 or more extra zeros in the effective qh wavefunction; these turn out to have multiplets $L = 0, 2, 4$. In a similar way we can identify the subsets with $2l$ or more extra zeros; the results are given in Table I [17].

Quasiholes are expected to repel one another. Thus states with extra zeros, which are further apart, are expected to be low in energy [12]. That is generally what we find (see

Table I). The multiplets which by our analysis should have extra zeros usually turn out to be either the lowest-energy multiplets, or among the lowest. These results give semiquantitative information about the details of the qh interactions which can explain features of the FQHE hierarchy. To begin with, notice that a daughter of the $1/m$ level exists whenever the ground state is nondegenerate. This happens when the state with $2l$ extra zeros is a singlet ($N_n^{2l} = 1$), if that state is the ground state. If this occurs for $2l = 2$, then there is one state in which all of the qh's avoid the minimum angular momentum (*i.e.*, in which they all have an extra pair of zeros). The resulting state is $\nu = 2/7$. The states in which all qh's have $2l = 4, 6, \dots$ extra relative zeros are, respectively, $\nu = 4/13, 6/19, \dots$

This arithmetic suggests which states might exist in the hierarchy picture [7,8]. Whether or not they actually are stable is a question of energetics. We assume the energy of qh states depends on their interactions, which can be described by effective pseudopotential parameters. Suppose $\tilde{V}_{2l}$ is the pseudopotential parameter for a pair of qh with an extra two units of RAM beyond the minimum required by statistics. We estimate the $\tilde{V}_{2l}$ by considering the case of $n = 2$ qh, since, in this case, every eigenstate has the qh in a state of definite RAM, and we can read off the $\tilde{V}_{2l}$ directly [18]. (These parameters have been estimated for qp, using a different method which is based on trial wavefunctions, by Béran and Morf [19].)

Our results are shown in Fig. 2. For example, for $N_e = 6$ electrons and $n = 2$ qh, the multiplets are in order $\tilde{V}_6 < \tilde{V}_2 < \tilde{V}_4 < \tilde{V}_0$; the multiplet with six extra zeros is the lowest in energy, that with no extra zeros the highest. The most interesting feature is that the $\tilde{V}_{2l}$ are non-monotonic, unlike the V_l which describe the Coulomb interaction between electrons. In every case tested we see one feature in common: $\tilde{V}_2 < \tilde{V}_4$. This non-monotonicity can explain the absence of certain fractions. The hierarchy construction predicts that $\nu = 4/13$ is a daughter of $1/3$ in which the qh avoid paying $\tilde{V}_2$, *i.e.*, every pair of qh has at least four extra zeros. By doing so, however, they pay a $\tilde{V}_4$ cost. If $\tilde{V}_4 > \tilde{V}_2$, as we find, the $\nu = 4/13$ state is not stable—a conclusion apparently consistent with experiment [20].

We also note that, in contrast to the estimates of Béran and Morf [19] for qp, our estimates for $\tilde{V}_{2l}$ are not always positive. These results are puzzling, but cannot be viewed as an artifact of our method: they simply mean that there are some 2-qh states which are lower in energy than twice the lowest 1-qh energy. Further study is needed to test the significance of this result.

The detailed analysis we have performed of the qh spectrum can be repeated for the qp case, with the important difference [21] that the gap separating the low-lying states is typically of the same magnitude as the splitting among these states—*ie*, of order V_1 [compare Figs. 1(a)) and 1(b)]. However, we can in most cases identify (in agreement with Ref. [12]) a low-energy subspace with which to test Haldane counting.

Haldane's argument suggests that qp should have statistics coefficient $\beta = -1/m$. Note that qp see electrons as flux in the opposite direction of that seen by qh, and so the appropriate pseudo-wavefunctions to guide analysis of the qp spectrum involve factors of the form [7] $(z_i^* - z_j^*)^{-1/m}$. However, such a behavior for qp at short distances is energetically costly [12]. Hence we expect not to see a subspace with negative β , but rather only subsets with $\beta = 2l - (1/m)$ for nonzero $2l$.

This expectation is borne out in our results. Repeating the procedure applied to qh states, we find a Haldane coefficient $\beta = 2 - 1/3$ for qp states near $\nu = 1/3$. For general

$\nu = 1/m$, this approach gives $\beta = 2 - 1/m$. As argued above, the states in the low-energy subspace can be viewed as those of $\beta = -1/3$ particles with 2 or more extra zeros. In fact, either the states with no extra zeros do not exist at all, or they are hidden in the higher-energy states. Hence it is better to view $\beta = 2 - 1/3$ as the fundamental statistics coefficient for the qp, to be compared with $\beta = 1/3$ for qh.

The multiplet structures can be also understood as in the qh case; and the result of such analysis is strikingly similar. We again find a consistently nonmonotonic behavior of the $\tilde{V}_{2l}$ ($\tilde{V}_4 > \tilde{V}_2$ always), with $\tilde{V}_2$ and $\tilde{V}_6$ typically negative. Hence we find, in close analogy to our qh result, that the 4/11 state should not be stable—again in agreement with experiment [20] and with previous work [22,19].

In summary, we have tested the application of Haldane’s generalization of the Pauli principle to charged excitations of the FQHE, using exact spectra for small numbers of electrons, and assuming only that we know the (fractional) charge for the excitations. At the largest energy scale at which the daughter states are defined, we find fractional exclusion coefficients $\beta_{qh} = 1/3$ and $\beta_{qp} = 2 - 1/3$. This approach also permits us to find subsets described by coefficients $\beta_{qh,qp} + 2l$. These states can be thought of as pseudo-wavefunctions with extra (pairs of) zeros in the relative coordinates. Our analysis then enables us to estimate the effective pseudopotential parameters for the excitations. These turn out to be non-monotonic with increasing relative angular momentum, which then implies that certain daughter states (*e.g.*, $\nu = 4/13$ and $\nu = 4/11$) should not be stable incompressible states.

G.S.C. acknowledges partial support from the NSF under Grant # DMR-9101542, and M.D.J. acknowledges partial support by the UCF Division of Sponsored Research. We acknowledge support from Florida State University by the allocation of supercomputer resources.

REFERENCES

- [1] See, e.g., *Fractional Statistics and Anyon Superconductivity*, ed. F. Wilczek (World Scientific, 1990), and references therein.
- [2] F.D.M. Haldane, Phys. Rev. Lett. **67**, 937 (1991).
- [3] For an elementary introduction see A.H. MacDonald, *A Perspective on the Quantum Hall Effect* (Klewer, Boston, 1989).
- [4] Daniel Arovas, J.R. Schrieffer and Frank Wilczek, Phys. Rev. Lett. **53**, 722 (1984).
- [5] R.B. Laughlin, in *The Quantum Hall Effect, 2nd. ed.*, ed. by R.E. Prange and S.M. Girvin (Springer-Verlag, New York, Berlin, Heidelberg, Tokyo, 1990).
- [6] J. Yang and W.P. Su, Phys. Rev. Lett. **70**, 1163 (1993).
- [7] B.I. Halperin, Phys. Rev. Lett. **52**, 1583 (1984).
- [8] F.D.M. Haldane, Phys. Rev. Lett. **51**, 605 (1983).
- [9] A.H. MacDonald and D.B. Murray, Phys. Rev. B, **32**, 2707 (1985); Michael Stone, Phys. Rev. B, **42**, 8399 (1990).
- [10] J.K. Jain, Phys. Rev. Lett. **63**, 199 (1989); G. Dev and J.K. Jain, *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **69**, 2843 (1992).
- [11] M.D. Johnson and A.H. MacDonald, in *Physical Phenomena at High Magnetic Fields*, ed. by E. Manousakis *et al.* (Addison-Wesley, Redwood, 1992), p. 102.
- [12] S. He, X.C. Xie, and F.C. Zhang, Phys. Rev. Lett. **68**, 3460 (1990).
- [13] M.D. Johnson and G.S. Canright, Phys. Rev. B **41**, 6870 (1990).
- [14] See for example T. Chakraborty and P. Pietilainen *The Fractional Quantum Hall Effect*, (Springer-Verlag, Berlin, 1988).
- [15] F.D.M. Haldane, Chap. 8 in *The Quantum Hall Effect, 2nd. ed.*, ed. by R.E. Prange and S.M. Girvin (Springer-Verlag, New York, Berlin, Heidelberg, Tokyo, 1990).
- [16] Given our identification of β with α for the lowest Landau level (which is appropriate here), our extraction of fractional β -statistics also implies fractional α -statistics.
- [17] We note that only for 2 qh does each multiplet correspond to states with a definite number of extra zeros. For example, with 3 qh and 6 electrons, there are 84 states below the V_1 gap, in 8 different multiplets. Of these, two multiplets ($L = 1, 3$) have two extra zeros.
- [18] We take $\tilde{V}_{2l} = (E_{2l} - E_0) - 2(E_1 - E_0)$, where E_{2l} is the energy of the relevant 2-qh multiplet and $E_{0,1}$ is the lowest-energy state with 0 or 1 qh present [19].
- [19] P. Béran and R. Morf, Phys. Rev. B **43**, 12654 (1991).
- [20] See, for example, V.J. Goldman, M. Shayegan, and D.C. Tsui, Phys. Rev. Lett. **61**, 881 (1988); and references in Refs. [21] and [22].
- [21] F.C. Zhang and X.C. Xie, Phys. Rev. B **40**, 11449 (1989).
- [22] Claudius Gros and A.H. MacDonald, Phys. Rev. B **42**, 9514 (1990); A.H. MacDonald, Surf. Sci. **229**, 1 (1990).

TABLES

TABLE I. Multiplicity of eigenstates for many-quasihole states near $\nu = 1/3$. N_e is the number of electrons, n the number of quasiholes, and N_L the corresponding number of states in the lowest Landau level on the sphere. N_n is the total number of quasihole states, *i.e.*, those lying below the gap of order V_1 . The remaining columns show the multiplicities of the degenerate states with no extra zeros, two or more extra zeros, etc. The multiplets are listed in order of increasing energy. Notice that states with extra zeros are typically lower in energy.

N_e	N_L	n	N_n	$2l \geq 0$	$2l \geq 2$	$2l \geq 4$	$2l \geq 6$
4	12	2	15	5,9,1	5,1	1	-
	13	3	35	1,7,9,5,13	1	-	-
	14	4	70	5,9,11,5,1,13,9,17	-	-	-
5	15	2	21	7,3,11	7,3	3	-
	16	3	56	4,10,8,12,6,16	4	-	-
	17	4	126	5,9,7,13,...	-	-	-
	18	5	252	4,10,8,12,...	-	-	-
6	18	2	28	1,9,5,13	1,9,5	1,5	1
	19	3	84	7,13,3,11,15,7,9,19	7,3	-	-
	20	4	210	1,9,13,7,...	1	-	-
	21	5	462	7,15,13,9,...	-	-	-
	22	6	924	1,9,13,5,...	-	-	-
7	21	2	36	11,3,7,15	11,3,7	3,7	3
	22	3	120	10,6,16,8,...	10,6,4	-	-

FIGURES

FIG. 1. (a) The low-energy spectrum for 2 quasiholes and 6 electrons on a sphere, in the truncated pseudopotential model with $V_3 = 0.01V_1$. The quasihole states lie below a gap of order V_1 and vary on an energy scale of order V_3 . (b) The low-energy spectrum for 3 quasiparticles and 8 electrons on a sphere, under the conditions of (a). The quasiparticle states lie below a less evident gap of order V_1 , and vary on an energy scale which is also of order V_1 .

FIG. 2. Effective pseudopotential parameters for quasiholes near $\nu = 1/3$, as extracted from two-quasihole spectra. $\tilde{V}_{2l}$ is the energy of a pair of quasiholes in a state with relative angular momentum $2l$ more than the minimum required by statistics. Notice the non-monotonicity which can explain the absence of certain FQHE fractions (see text). The solid lines are for the truncated pseudopotential model, with $V_3 = 0.01V_1$. The dashed line is the Coulomb result (in units of e^2/ℓ , where ℓ is the magnetic length). We find similar results for quasiparticles.